Volume 24, 2021 ISSN: 2165-1019 Approved November 2021 www.ala.org/aasl/slr

r

## **Pamela Harland, EdD,** School L j Ñ&ÝÝÜÒ "ñ-"®â7`Í-Ñ,ÝÞ¡ÍÞÁÀ Ç% \$ 7a.ûÀÀÀ , Anita Cellucci, MEd LMS, High School Librarian, Westborough, Massachusetts

The dissemination and adoption of new standards is of primary concern to national education associations, the American Association of School Librarians (AASL) among them. The purpose of this content-analysis study was to investigate the impact of the National School Library Standards for Learners, School Librarians, and School Libraries (AASL 2018) on the School Leader Collaborative members' understandings of and advocacy for the roles and responsibilities of school librarians. These members were all public school administrators. The researchers used documents co-developed by AASL and the Collaborative to create a category matrix to analyze the content of primary and secondary source videos. The results of the study show the extent to which these exemplary administrators value leadership and other responsibilities of school librarians. Their perspectives offer practicing and preservice school librarians spe1(e)4(]TJ T83s)1(o10s)4(])4(x)4()nss ve to c s(of)-2(f2(h2(e)4(r)-1(pr\* [(s(s)-1(us0(ndar)-)-2(c)4(e)]TJ -9.23 -1.15 Td [(1)-2(i)-2(bh)2(i2(e)4(ade)4)4(r)- *Standards*" (Lewis 2020). The school administrators in the Collaborative also believed that implementing the *National School Library Standards for Learners, School Librarians, and School Libraries* (referred to as the "2018 Standards" in this study) would help school librarians positively impact their schools.

Nationally in the Unit Tc 0 Tit Tc S-5(S-i24 re NTc 0c -0EoSt)-2(a1(i)-2(e)(ST)-8(I) BT n4 re122 <</MCIE

research studies and professional articles (Barnett 2021; Burns 2020; Church 2015; Elkins 2018; Lewis et al. 2021; Mackley 2021; Madsen and Rinio 2021; Moreillon, Cahill, and McKee 2012). Standards dissemination and implementation can be a challenge in any profession.

One goal of national standards is to guide the education of preservice school librarians. In a 2014 study of nine graduate-level school librarian preparation programs (Moreillon, Kimmel, and Gavigan 2014), researchers found very little overlap in required course readings and no

Town Hall Artifact AASL Town Hall (AASL 2020e)	In this video, members of the Collaborative share their perspectives about the leadership of school librarians during pandemic learning conditions and answer questions about how to best approach administrators while going through the 2020–2021 school year and planning for the next. (01:02:00)	Primary
--	--	---------

During phase one we developed an inter-rater process for analyzing the category codes. First, each brief video was transcribed, and the transcripts searched for the five roles and six Shared Foundations keywords. Then, for Artifacts 1 and 2, we discussed every sentence and coded the data together using the indicators on the category matrix. We set and met our inter-rater goal: 75 percent agreement.

In phase two each of us independently analyzed the transcripts of Artifacts 3 and 4, and met to share and discuss our coding. Again at least a 75 percent inter-rater reliability was achieved. We continued the iterative data analysis process with discussions around indicator descriptions developed during the analysis of the secondary data sources. To guide our interpretations, we also began looking for themes, key concepts, and patterns as well as identifying noteworthy quotes in the data.

In phase three the process developed for the secondary data sources was applied to the Town Hall Artifact (AASL 2020e). This video data was transcribed and organized for analysis around the eight questions posed during the one-hour meeting. We conducted independent ratings and met to compare and discuss the coding. A 75 percent inter-rating consensus was achieved. We also discussed key quotes and patterns in this data. Town Hall Artifact findings are reported later in this document in relationship to the eight questions.

At the time of the 2019 AASL National Conference, the Collaborative members were familiar with the 2018 Standards, but they had not had much time to interact with AASL's "School Librarian Job Description," "School Librarian Interview Question Matrix," the AASL leaders, and with their fellow Collaborative members.

The following tables are organized by each of the four secondary source videos. The indicators cited in the tables were noted by three or more Collaborative members and were coded with at least a 75 percent inter-rater reliability. In addition, for an indicator to be included on a table, at least three of the administrators' comments related to the individual indicator cited. The appendix contains a complete list of indicators (arranged by categories) and their code numbers.

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
	Objectives, Goals, Assessments		
Program Administrator	4.1 Collection Development / Collection Management; Connection to EDI	3/7	"Any initiative that the school, the district, even a grade level subject area has they know that they can go to the library to get resources, to have activities, to engage with students, and make those things come alive."
Collaborate	7.2 Develop Collaborative Working Teams	3/7	"My school librarians are critical to engaging all content areas together."
	7.4 Collaboration w/Classroom Educator	6/7	"I think that the librarians often set the tone for collaboration. Our librarians are the ones who are incubating ideas in their space that often become evident in our classrooms."
	7.5 Collaboration w/Principal / Connection to School Vision	4/7	"Without professional librarians to not only oversee the collection but to initiate programs, to partner with me on school level initiatives, to be a leader on committees, and at the school level, the district level, the state level learning would suffer, outcomes would

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
Leader	0.2 Takes Action - Responds to Challenges and Opportunities to Increase Effectiveness	5/7	"What the shifts and standards have meant is that students should experience school in a completely different way: Project-based learning, depth versus breadth."
Instructional Partner	<ul><li>1.6 Instructional</li><li>Design:</li><li>Objectives,</li><li>Goals,</li><li>Assessments</li></ul>	3/7	"The national standards are looked at by ELA with school librarians, and then we reach out to the science team, the social studies team, all of the various levels within the district."
Collaborate	7.4 Collaboration w/Classroom Educator	3/7	"[School librarians] have such influence: collaboration, working with other teachers to help grow their practice, developing that level of reading. I love that there is a through line in the standards."

Table 3. Artifact 3: "Administrators on #AASLStandards" (AASL 2020a).

The Artifact 4 testimonials in this video (see table 4) centered on equity, diversity, and inclusion. It is not surprising that comments clustered around the leader role and the Include Shared Foundation. Include and Explore Shared Foundation comments were also focused in the leader role. From the beginning of their service on the Collaborative, members understood and valued the critical role of school librarians in enacting equity, diversity, and inclusion in their schools. ia-150.ce oc12s68.the1 Artifct 4 testimo

Volume 24

Taking action to respond to challenges was the indicator that emerged the most frequently throughout this Town Hall meeting. School leaders, including librarians, were forced to respond to unique challenges throughout the pandemic. Even before the pandemic, the administrators highlighted the need for librarians to take action in response to challenges, as evidenced in the secondary artifacts. Many of the actions taken by school librarians will remain in place following a return to mostly in-person learning during the coming years. These administrators repeatedly emphasized that a librarian's willingness to take action without direction leads to increased opportunities for all. Participating administrators were not asking librarians to work harder. Instead, administrators were asking librarians to do what they could to change a circumstance by identifying the ways they could lead improvements in particular situations.

The following tables summarize the findings for each of the eight questions asked during the Town Hall. Each table is organized by matrix category indicators, the frequency of comments in that particular category based on the number of Collaborative members who addressed that particular question, and sample quotes that further indicate their perspectives on school librarians' roles and responsibilities. The indicators cited in the tables were noted by three or more Collaborative members and were coded with at least a 75 percent inter-rater reliability.

The first question (see table 5.1) was asked by the town hall facilitator AASL past-president Kathryn Roots Lewis.

Collaborative members noted that librarians proactively responded to multiple modalities of teaching during the pandemic by working collaboratively on curriculum, finding creative ways to provide students with books, and through the use of digital tools and resources to support student

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
Information Specialist	2.1 Technology Tools to Supplement School Resources	3/6	The pandemic "forced us to look at new innovative methods."

The second question (see table 5.2) was asked by one of the school librarians in attendance.

The administrators emphasized the need for librarians to take action to respond to some of the challenges faced in the area of access to resources and instruction. Throughout the pandemic, librarians collaborated with classroom educators and provided multiple innovative methods to connect with students. Librarians offered multiple modalities of instruction and access to books by extending the physical and virtual spaces of the library to expand reading opportunities to the entire school community.

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
Leader	0.2 Takes Action - responds to challenges and opportunities to increase effectiveness	3/5	"We learned new methods to get various instructional materials through library services and stuff that we would have never done before. [The pandemic] kind of forced us in a way to look at new innovative methods."

The third question (see table 5.3) was asked by a school librarian in attendance.

The administrators collectively repeated that librarians should take action through collaborative work specifically with the school principal. Leadership came up several times during the answers to this question. The administrators emphasized a librarian's ability to instruct students and classroom educators on access to and use of different information sources as an important element of leadership. It is important to note that the original question referred to makerspaces, and none of the Collaborative members' responses specifically mentioned makerspaces.

of SLR

Volume

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
Collaborate	7.5 Collaboration w/Principal / Connection to School Vision	4/5	"Share the AASL standards and make sure that [principals] know what those are because most of you are trying to do important work around those. So if they see how those connect with the larger scope of what's really important to us as leaders they're going to buy in."
Explore	9.1 Leader, Change-maker, Thought-leader	4/5	"[The librarian] has created her own way of communicating which I absolutely support. She never asked me if she could, and she doesn't need to. But she has made herself invaluable the skills and what she offers to our community are so amazing, and she just has figured out a way to make herself essential."

Question six (see table 5.6) was the final question asked live by a school librarian during the town hall.

Librarians take action to build relationships both within and outside of the school community by reaching out and sharing stories with school boards and with state and national leaders to increase effectiveness. The administrators noted it is important to be able to "tell the story" of the library, which includes how librarians participate and lead in Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) within the school. Administrators also suggested librarians invite elected officials to visit their libraries. The emphasis in these collective responses was on taking the initiative to reach out to decision makers.

Category	Inc	licator	Frequency	Quotes
Leader	Act resp cha opp inc	Takes tion - ponds to allenges and portunities to rease ectiveness	3/3	"You can also reach out to [elected officials'] offices, their field offices, and let them know about your concerns and things that you're thinking about related to libraries."
	of	SLRSchool Libra	ary Researchwww	, ala.org/aasl/slr

Table 5.6. Q6: What can we do to help Joe Biden and whoever he chooses to lead the DOE (Department of Education) to include librarians in their education initiatives?

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
Explore	9.1 Leader, Change-maker, Thought-leader	3/3	"Try to be involved even at your state level in the legislative processes, and then where you have the opportunity to be involved, at the national level and speaking to your representatives."

The seventh question (see table 5.7) was posed by the AASL Practice Committee.

Collaborative members noted that librarians collaborate with classroom educators by taking part in team meetings, proactively examining student benchmark data, and sharing solutions with principals. One administrator indicated the importance of being involved in PLCs during the early planning stages so that school librarians can share solutions with the team. Another added that the willingness to share PLC work with the school principal extends collaborative efforts by increasing relationships and creates future opportunities for collaboration. Several of the administrators echoed that participation in PLCs and taking action proactively were important steps for a school librarian to take.

Table 5.7. Q7: In what ways are your librarians collaborating with classroom educators to address learning loss during this pandemic and how do you help make that collaboration an expectation?

Category	Indicator	Frequency	Quotes
Leader	0.2 Takes Action - responds to challenges and opportunities to increase effectiveness	3/3	"As we got our benchmark data for the year [the librarian] immediately saw: Okay we had some reading loss, and our sixth graders and fifth graders aren't where they typically are. So she worked on a new schoolwide reading initiative."
Explore	9.1 Leader, Change-maker, Thought-leader	3/3	"[The librarian's] not afraid to say 'hey don't forget this is important,' gives me what I need to put it out every week to our parents, so we have family engagement with it. And so she's looking for those opportunities and not waiting on me to say 'hey, I've seen this data. What do you

Table 6. Cross-question the

The comments by the Collaborative rarely mentioned the integration of technology by school librarians. It is obvious that librarians  $w^2(e)^4(nt)^2(s - W) \cos^2(i)^2(ve)^4()]T-6y$  me tteg graology by stie in the school of the

school librarians do now—and in the future—involves working with others. Without these collaborative efforts and intentional relationships, school librarians will not reach their capacity to lead, and learning and teaching through the library will not be interconnected with the entire school community.

 both the leader and instructional partners roles. Explore indicators were mentioned as well. The members of the Collaborative shared multiple stories, specific examples, and practical solutions for school librarians to use to take action.

This research study involved seven exemplary administrators who had prior knowledge of the 2018 Standards and had served as advocates for school librarians and libraries prior to being selected for the Collaborative. They were nominated by AASL members and were vetted based on their resumés and commitment to this volunteer opportunity. Their understandings may or may not reflect those of other principals and superintendents from across the country. That said, their perspectives and priorities for the practice of school librarianship are valuable to increasing the effectiveness of the profession.

This study focused on the artifacts developed by the Collaborative, in conjunction with AASL. Researchers in the future could pursue interviews with the Collaborative members in an effort to see how this experience impacted them and how their perspectives on and priorities for the roles and responsibilities of school librarians may have evolved. Further research could also discover how the Collaborative artifacts influenced the understandings of other school administrators and school librarians.

The content-analysis process was useful in determining how keywords, concepts, and themes used by AASL appeared or did not appear in these artifact transcripts. A pre-publication contentanalysis of proposed future standards would be valuable to help quantify and analyze the vocabulary and ideas used to ensure they align with those used or understood by stakeholder groups. Professional organizations refresh and publish up-to-date standards for the purpose of guiding the implementation of currently recognized excellence. An early analysis of the terminology used in standards would be valuable in any profession.

This study identified a tension between the 2018 Standards and the priorities of the administrators who served on the Collaborative, namely the critical importance of the leader role of school librarians and their work as instructional partners. Although the 2018 Standards imply the role of "leader," leadership behaviors are not specifically defined in the standards. The original printing of the 2018 Standards book's index includes a reference to just one page focused on this role, which is the one-paragraph definition brought forward from EL (AASL 2018, 307). A replacement index was later commissioned with additional locators to the leader role.

Collaboration is mentioned more frequently in the 2018 Standards due to the "Collaborate" Shared Foundation, but specific mention of the instructional partner role, which includes coplanning, co-teaching, and co-assessing student outcomes, is mentioned only in the "School Library Evaluation Checklist" (AASL 2018, 174, 176), not in the standards themselves. In the index, there are references to the "instructional partner role for school librarians" on four pages plus the definition that was likewise brought forward from EL (AASL 2018, 307). The

Lewis, Kathryn Roots. 2020. "School Administrators and the Power of School Librarians." *Knowledge Quest* blog (April 29). <a href="https://knowledgequest.aasl.org/school-administrators-and-the-power-of-school-librarians">https://knowledgequest.aasl.org/school-administrators-and-the-power-of-school-librarians</a>> (accessed January 7, 2021).

Lewis, Kathryn Roots, et al. 2021. "The Oklahoma Standard: Adoidoidoie 0 c)ĐH)À@ @ J 2sa,,2Æ 0

- Sturge, Jennifer. 2021. "Four Roadmaps for AASL Standards Adoption." *Knowledge Quest* 49 (3): 6–7.
- Todd, Ross J., Carol A. Gordon, and Ya-Ling Lu. 2011. One Common Goal: Student Learning: Report of Findings and Recommendations of the New Jersey Library Study Phase 2. Center for International Scholarship in School Libraries. <https://sites.comminfo.rutgers.edu/cissl/wpcontent/uploads/sites/8/2020/01/njasl\_phase-\_2\_final\_0.pdf> (accessed November 18, 2021).
- White, Marilyn Domas, and Emily E. Marsh. 2006. "Content Analysis: A Flexible Methodology." *Library Trends* 55 (1): 22–45.

Code	Indicator	Description		
1	Instructional Partner			
1.1	Collaborative Assignments Matched to Academic Standards (A) (B)	Works with teacher(s) on planning, co-teaching connected to classroom standards, curriculum - keywords: align across disciplines/grade levels, grow practice (see also 7.4)		
1.2	Collaborative Assignments Promoting Critical Thinking (A) (B)	Works with teacher(s) on planning/co-teaching connected to critical thinking- keywords: think (as in Think, Create, Share, Grow) (see also 3.1)		
1.3	Collaborative Assignments Promoting Info. Literacy (A) (B)	Works with teacher(s) on planning/co-teaching info lit. (see also 2.5)		
1.4	Collaborative Assignments Promoting Technology skills (A) (B)	Works with teacher(s) on planning/co-teaching digital/tech skills.		
1.5	Collaborative Assignments Promoting Social Skills / Cultural Competencies (A)	Works with teacher(s) on planning/co-teaching social skills and/or cultural competence. keywords: culturally responsive teaching		

Code	Indicator	Description

Collaborative Program Mission, Plan, Policies (A) Both School and Library

4.2

Code	Indicator	Description
6.3	Appropriate Reading/Instructional Resources - All Formats/Multiple Perspectives (C)	
6.4	Discussion/Active Debate re: Multiple/Diverse Viewpoints (C)	Engaging learners in discussions and debate
6.5	Physical Space/Policies to Promote Inviting/Respectful Inclusive Environment (C)	Physical space only
7	Collaborate	·

7.1

Volume 24